Where the Blame Lies: America's Relationship with Migrants in Times of Crisis

Brian Milara Fall 2021

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Part 1: Unit Overview

Part 2: Planning with Standards

Part 3: 3-Day Unit Plan
Part 4: Lesson Plans

Part 1: Unit Overview

Potential grade level: 11th Grade

Unit Title: Where the Blame Lies¹: America's Relationship with Migrants in Times of Crisis

Topic: Migrant Scapegoating

Topic Justification (How does this topic address 4I's, 6 elements, CCW, community responsiveness, student interest)

To construct this unit from a social justice perspective, I have highlighted the ways in which it reflects the principles of five related pedagogical frameworks. This unit looks at how institutionalized oppression, in accordance with the 4 I's, has manifested itself in the detention of various migrant groups of color across history, connecting today's experiences to those of Japanese-Americans during World War II (Pipes, 2016). It implements principles of Picower's (2012) six elements of social justice curricular design because it is predicated on the injustice done to migrant groups when our society labels them as dangerous, but seeks to frame the issue as one activist organizations and politicians are seeking to rectify through reform, and highlights actions that students and the community can take (pp. 4-5). By focusing on the work being done in the students' own community (i.e., changes to migrant detention at Essex County jail), seeing it as a unique place with unique needs influenced by national trends, it embraces community-responsive pedagogy (Duncan-Andrade, 2016). Because the unit will call on students to tap into community connections in the interest of improving community outcomes, it necessarily relies upon cultural capital in such forms as family, social networks, aspiration, and resistance, thus reflecting Yosso's (2005) concept of community cultural wealth. (pp. 77-81). In designing the performance tasks, I have focused on ways to reflect student interest as part of a larger effort at universal design, by diversifying the potential formats the presentation deliverable may take.

Themes (about 4-6 words or phrases)

- Immigration & immigration reform
- Ethnoracial scapegoating
- Preemptive criminalization
- Persecution

¹ From the title of a Grant E. Hamilton (1891) political cartoon blaming immigrants for America's perceived social "ills."

Enduring Understandings:

What do you want students to remember 10 years from now?

- 1. Students will understand that there is a historical legacy of persecution in the name of public safety.
- 2. Students will understand that we sometimes rationalize state-sponsored maltreatment of and violence against groups of people we believe *did* or *might* do us harm.
- 3. Students will understand that community activism can, and does, play a role in enacting reform on issues of public concern.

Essential Questions:

What question provides a doorway into this topic?

- 1. Can fear be a weapon?
- 2. Does blame create fear, or does fear create blame?

Abstract

This unit will focus on the ideology of migrant scapegoating (especially when those migrants are people of color) and how this blame has produced a carceral pattern based not on punishment, but presupposition, of crime. It follows up on a district curricular lesson arc in which students study the internment of Japanese-Americans and extends the theme of scapegoating to current examples, such as refugees from Afghanistan and Central America. This unit will scaffold research methods with a curated set of sources, including news stories, video clips, interviews, and opinion polling, as well as websites of reform groups like NJ Alliance for Immigrant Justice and American Friends Service Committee. This, in turn, will support students in creating presentations using widely-accessible media (e.g., TikTok videos, drafts of murals and street art, music, newspaper guest op-ed, speech at state senator/assemblymember town hall) with the goal of collective advocacy and spurring the community and urging policymakers to view the changes to migrant detention in Newark either as a model to be followed or avoided.

Part 2: Planning With Standards

NJS Standards Addressed: Use the **2020 standards** for your subject area and find between 3-8 standards that cover the unit you are planning. Regardless of your subject area, also choose 3-7 social studies standards that cover your unit that you could use to justify why your topic is appropriate. http://www.state.nj.us/education/cccs/. Feel free to use any other content standards that fit your unit.

Standards for your subject area

- **6.3.12.HistoryCA.1:** Analyze the impact of current governmental practices and laws affecting national security and/or First Amendment rights and privacy (e.g., immigration, refugees, seizure of personal property, juvenile detention, listening devices, deportation, religion in schools).
- **6.3.12.CivicsPD.1:** Develop plan for public accountability and transparency in government related to a particular issue(s) and share the plan with appropriate government officials.
- **RH.11-12.7:** Integrate and evaluate multiple sources of information presented in diverse formats and media (e.g., visually, quantitatively, qualitatively, as well as in words) in order to address a question or solve a problem.

Part 3: 3 Day Unit

Unit Title: *Where the Blame Lies*: America's Relationship with Migrants in Times of Crisis

Teacher: Brian Milara

Grade: 11

Unit Description:

This unit will focus on the ideology of migrant scapegoating and how this blame has produced a carceral pattern based not on punishment, but presupposition, of crime. It follows up on a district curricular lesson arc in which students study the internment of Japanese-Americans and extends the theme of scapegoating to current examples, such as refugees from Afghanistan and Central America. This unit will scaffold research methods with a curated set of sources, including news stories, video clips, interviews, and opinion polling, as well as websites of reform groups like NJ Alliance for Immigrant Justice and American Friends Service Committee. This, in turn, will support students in creating presentations using widely-accessible media (e.g., TikTok videos, drafts of murals and street art, music, newspaper guest op-ed, speech at state senator/assemblymember town hall) with the goal of

Standards Addressed:

- 6.3.12.HistoryCA.1: Analyze the impact of current governmental practices and laws affecting national security and/or First Amendment rights and privacy (e.g., immigration, refugees, seizure of personal property, juvenile detention, listening devices, deportation, religion in schools).
- **6.3.12.CivicsPD.1:** Develop plan for public accountability and transparency in government related to a particular issue(s) and share the plan with appropriate government officials.
- RH.11-12.7: Integrate and evaluate multiple sources of information presented in diverse

collective advocacy and spurring the community and urging policymakers to view the changes to migrant detention in Newark either as a model to be followed or avoided.

formats and media (e.g., visually, quantitatively, qualitatively, as well as in words) in order to address a question or solve a problem.

Enduring Understandings:

- 1. Students will understand that there is a historical legacy of persecution in the name of public safety.
- 2. Students will understand that we sometimes rationalize state-sponsored maltreatment of and violence against groups of people we believe *did* or *might* do us harm.
- 3. Students will understand that community activism can, and does, play a role in enacting reform on issues of public concern.

Essential Questions

- 1. Can fear be a weapon?
- 2. Does blame create fear, or does fear create blame?

List Individual Student Needs:

- Technological access cannot be assumed, as some students do not have district-issued devices at this time (encourage groups for device-sharing and make materials accessible via cell phones)
- Multiple means of representation (videos, read alouds, podcasts with transcripts, data sets)
- Timing: students may need a refresher on references to Japanese-American internment due to the weekend or unplanned changes in pacing (consider video as a potential advanced schema before Day 1, if necessary)

D	ay	Daily Mini-Lesson Summary (Reading/Writing Workshop: Mini-lesson, Guided/Small Group/Independent Practice, Closure)	Assessment: Phrased as: "Students will demonstrate understanding of (CONTENT) as evidenced by (PRODUCT)"	
	Day 1	 Do Now: Write about a time you (or someone you know) were blamed for something you didn't do. What happened because of it? Why do you think you got blamed? Group source analysis using <u>"Perspectives of Migration" handout</u> (6-7 per group; 2-3 per source): 	Students will demonstrate understanding of the historic legacy of migrant persecution, as evidenced by discussion of their group source analysis with the teacher and their peers. Students will demonstrate understanding of the historic	

	 Video: "KT McFarland blasts Pentagon's plan to relocate Afghan refugees to US" Data/Article (excerpt): "Modern Immigration Wave Brings 59 Million to U.S., Driving Population Growth and Change Through 2065" Podcast: "In The Story Of U.S. Immigration, Black Immigrants Are Often Left Out" Share-out of comparisons to "Japanese Relocation" video (from previous lesson arc) Exit Ticket (see right column) Homework/Advanced Schema: Independent reading of "Japanese Americans among hundreds protesting plan to detain migrant children at Fort Sill" & comprehension exercise 	legacy of migrant persecution, as evidenced by an exit ticket response connecting justifications used for Japanese-American internment to modern-day examples. Students will demonstrate understanding of the historic legacy of migrant persecution, as evidenced by their listing of 2 similarities between Fort Sill's past and present. (Homework/Advanced Schema)
Day 2	 Do Now: Reflect on your notes from last night's reading. Share the similarities you noticed with a partner, and be prepared to share your group's findings with the class. Direct Instruction: Explicit connection of issue to Newark, and introduction to gallery walk Independent Practice: Migrant detention perspectives gallery walk in groups (modified text), with commentary written on chart paper at each station: immigration lawyer/advocate; immigration judge; border patrol agent Exit Ticket (see right column) Homework/Advanced Schema: Viewing of "Essex County ends contracts with ICE" & comprehension questions 	Students will demonstrate understanding of the state-sponsored maltreatment of detained migrants, as evidenced by their chart paper responses during the gallery walk. Students will demonstrate understanding of the state-sponsored maltreatment of detained migrants, as evidenced by an exit ticket response identifying systemic challenges faced by detainees. Students will demonstrate understanding of the state-sponsored maltreatment of detained migrants, as evidenced by their responses to comprehension questions on a video concerning the termination of Essex County Jail's contract with ICE. (Homework/Advanced

		Schema)
Day 3	 Do Now: Do you think Essex County was right or wrong to stop using the county jail for immigrant detention? Why or why not? Direct Instruction: Recap of ICE definition, conditions at jail, role of immigrant rights activism in ending the contract, and the continuation of contracts by some facilities in the state Introduce project and model presentation exemplars with presentation interactive notebook Students work in groups of 3-4 to assume the role of activists in arguing in favor of or against the use of Newark as a model Students decide upon a presentation format, and outline their argument and 3 pieces of supporting evidence Continue working on project for homework 	Students will demonstrate understanding of the role community activism can have on immigrant policy, as evidenced by a presentation in support of, or opposing, following the decision in Newark to stop detaining migrants in our jails statewide.

Part 4: Lesson Plan

Day 1: December 6th

Name: Brian Milara	Topic/Title: Blaming the Migrant		Grade Level: 11 / CT: Yvette Jordan
1a. STANDARDS 6.3.12.HistoryCA.1: Analyze the imparactices and laws affecting national srights and privacy (e.g., immigration, property, juvenile detention, listening schools).	act of current governmental ecurity and/or First Amendment refugees, seizure of personal	1b. ENDURING UN Students will understa public safety.	IDERSTANDINGS and that there is a historical legacy of persecution in the name of

RH.11-12.7: Integrate and evaluate multiple sources of information presented in diverse formats and media (e.g., visually, quantitatively, qualitatively, as well as in words) in order to address a question or solve a problem.

2a. TIERED STUDENT LEARNING OBJECTIVES

Learning Intention: I am learning about trends in perceptions of immigrants in the United States.

Success Criteria: I can describe similarities between how Japanese-Americans were portrayed during WWII and how immigrants are portrayed today.

2b. TEACHER CONTENT KNOWLEDGE (necessary prior knowledge)

Japanese-American internment was born out of many of the same xenophobic stereotypes that characterize more modern efforts at either limiting the entry of migrants (including refugees) into the country, or otherwise incarcertating them at higher rates when they arrive. They are blamed for the challenges facing our society (e.g., Afghans for terrorism, Central Americans for the drug trade and gang violence). This scapegoating of entire ethnic groups for issues that not only implicate a small handful of individuals, but implicate people far beyond these specific groups, makes it easier for society to blame the people it fears, rather than fear the people it blames.

3. ASSESSMENT

Formative: Do Now & discussion (questions below); Questioning during group source analysis (questions below)

Summative: Exit Ticket

4. INDIVIDUALIZED STUDENT NEEDS

- CI: Written methods of assessment (i.e., Do Now notes, handout responses, exit ticket)
- SLD/OHI: Delegation of duties in groups, frequent check-ins during group work, posting of all lesson materials in Google Classroom for review/reference, extended time to complete assignments
- ELL: Small-group reading with bilingual partner (assign to Source C), translated handout (all hardcopy because students have not yet been assigned Chromebooks)
- Multiple means of representation (video, data set, podcast w/transcript)
- Technological access cannot be assumed, as some students do not have district-issued devices at this time (encourage groups for device-sharing and make materials accessible via cell phones)

materials decessible via cent phones)				
PROCEDURE AND PRACTICE				
TEACHER'S ROLE Questions to Ask	WHAT ARE STUDENTS DOING?	MATERIALS		

1. LAUNCH/STARTER/ANTICIPATORY SET (5 min. writing; 5 min. discussion) Display & introduce Do Now: Write about a time you (or someone you know) were blamed for something you didn't do. What happened because of it? Why do you think you got blamed?	Respond to Do Now question in Google Classroom or notebooks.	Google Slides: <u>Do</u> <u>Now</u>
Lead discussion: Model with story of accusing sister of taking power bank. Elicit several student responses. Do you think that if someone expects you to do something wrong, they might try to stop you before you can even do it? How might they do that? Make connection to Japanese-American internment explicit, then broaden to other immigrant groups (through success criteria).	Share out experiences, respond, and make connections to classmates' experiences.	
2. LEARNING ACTIVITIES (20 min.) Introduce group source analysis (in Google Classroom, or hard copy) and how it will help us get an idea of how people see immigrant groups.	Ask clarifying questions and restate directions in their own words.	"Perspectives on Migration Handout" (digital or hardcopy)
Support student self-sorting, delegation of responsibility (2-3 per source per group), and distribute hard copies of handout to students without Chromebooks.	Create groups of 6-7 and delegate responsibility for each source to 2-3 people within each group.	(digital of hardcopy)
Circulate between groups to check for understanding: How are immigrants being portrayed in your source? How do you know that? What specific evidence can you find to support that? How is this similar to how Japanese-Americans were described during WWII?	Work in their pairs/trios to read, watch, or listen to their selected source and complete chart in handout. Respond to teacher questioning during meetings.	
Elicit whole-class responses from standouts during group work. Define the term "scapegoating" and connect it to the discussion.	Share out responses from group work.	
3. CLOSURE (5 min.) Explain exit ticket: What is 1 similarity you noticed between how Japanese-Americans were portrayed and how modern immigrants were portrayed in our sources today? Direct students to last slide in the Google Slides presentation or the bottom of the handout.	Respond to exit ticket question in the same handout.	"Perspectives on Migration Handout" (digital or hardcopy)

Collect handouts upon egress.	Turn in handout in Google Classroom or as hardcopy upon egress.	
HOMEWORK/FOLLOW UP ACTIVITY Direct students to assignment posted on Google Slide on board and in Google Classroom.	Read article and list 2 similarities they notice between how Fort Sill was used in the past, and how the government recently tried to use it.	Google Slides: Homework Article: "History repeats? Born in former internment camp, woman fights migrant kids' detention"

Day 2: December 7th

Name: Brian Milara	Topic/Title: Punishing the Migrant		Grade Level: 11 / CT: Yvette Jordan
6.3.12.HistoryCA.1: Analyze the impact of current governmental		1b. ENDURING UNDERSTANDINGS Students will understand that we sometimes rationalize state-sponsored maltreatment of and violence against groups of people we believe <i>did</i> or <i>might</i> do us harm.	
2a. TIERED STUDENT LEARNING <i>Learning Intention</i> : I am learning about from the perspectives of various people.	at the immigrant detention system	Detention centers for	TENT KNOWLEDGE (necessary prior knowledge) immigrants and their families continue to exist, as evidenced by every same camps used to incarcerate Japanese-Americans

Success Criteria: I can list challenges faced by people navigating the
immigrant detention system.

during World War II has recently been used as a holding facility for migrant children. Even when the venue has changed, the practice of treating immigrants like criminals remains largely unchanged, emerging from the mentality of preemptive criminalization.

3. ASSESSMENT

Formative: Day 1 Advanced Schema; Do Now & discussion (questions below); Questioning during gallery walk (questions below)

Summative: Exit Ticket

4. INDIVIDUALIZED STUDENT NEEDS

- CI: Written methods of assessment (i.e., homework notes for Do Now, gallery walk notes, exit ticket)
- SLD/OHI: Frequent check-ins during group work, posting of all lesson materials in Google Classroom for review/reference, extended time to complete assignments
- ELL: Group reading with bilingual partner, translated readings
- Technological access cannot be assumed, as some students do not have district-issued devices at this time (encourage groups for device-sharing and make materials accessible via cell phones)

PROCEDURE AND PRACTICE

TEACHER'S ROLE Questions to Ask	WHAT ARE STUDENTS DOING?	MATERIALS
1. LAUNCH/STARTER/ANTICIPATORY SET (5 min. in pairs; 5 min. whole-class) Display & introduce Do Now: Reflect on your notes from last night's reading. Share the similarities you noticed with a partner, and be prepared to share your group's findings with the class. Circulate between pairs, listening for, and asking about, the experience of immigrant detention.	Use notes from Google Classroom or notebook to reflect on the reading and compare findings with a partner.	Google Slides: <u>Do</u> <u>Now</u>
Lead discussion: Elicit whole-class responses from several students, spotlighting standouts. Why did Japanese-Americans and indigenous Americans protest at Fort Sill? Why was this place so important to them? Is history repeating itself? Connect Fort Sill to detention centers around	Share out group findings, respond, and make connections to classmates' responses.	

the country and explain that we have them here in New Jersey—including Newark (until recently).		
2. LEARNING ACTIVITIES (20 min.) Introduce gallery walk activity as a way to get a better look at the experience of migrant detention and the challenges of getting out. Explain that students are to make a note on the experiences of immigrants for each of the sources, and what evidence leads them to this conclusion. Review expectations for each station and roles for group members using this slide. Support student self-sorting and relocation (exactly 6 groups split evenly).	Ask clarifying questions and restate directions in their own words. Create 6 groups and congregate at one of the stations in the room.	Chart paper Markers (3 different colors; belong to group) Hardcopies of sources for each station
Circulate between groups to check for understanding: What is the experience of detained immigrants, according to your source? How do you know that? What specific evidence can you find to support that? Elicit whole-class responses from standouts during group work. Connect back to the use of the county prison for migrant detention. (Again), is history repeating itself? What does what you learned today make you think	Work in their groups to read their source. On chart paper, make notes of how detained immigrants are treated and provide direct quotes for each. Respond to teacher questioning during meetings. Rotate between sources (4 minutes each, 3 sources in total). Share out responses from group work.	Source A Source B Source C Google Slides: Gallery Walk Expectations & Timer
about those migrants detained here in Newark? 3. CLOSURE (5 min.) Explain exit ticket: What are 2 challenges that people in immigrant	Respond to exit ticket question in Google Classroom or notebooks.	Google Slides: <u>Exit</u>
detention face? Direct students to last slide in the Google Slides presentation or the bottom of the handout. Collect handouts upon egress.	Turn in handout in Google Classroom or as hardcopy upon egress.	Ticket
HOMEWORK/FOLLOW UP ACTIVITY Direct students to assignment posted on Google Slide on board and in Google Classroom.	Watch video and respond to embedded comprehension questions.	Google Slides: <u>Homework</u>

	Video: "Essex County
	ends contracts with
	ICE"

Day 3: December 8th

Name: Brian Milara	Topic/Title: Group Project		Grade Level: 11 / CT: Yvette Jordan
1a. STANDARDS 6.3.12.CivicsPD.1: Develop plan for public accountability and transparency in government related to a particular issue(s) and share the plan with appropriate government officials. RH.11-12.7: Integrate and evaluate multiple sources of information presented in diverse formats and media (e.g., visually, quantitatively, qualitatively, as well as in words) in order to address a question or solve a problem.		1b. ENDURING UNDERSTANDINGS Students will understand that community activism can, and does, play a role in enacting reform on issues of public concern.	
2a. TIERED STUDENT LEARNING Learning Intention: I am learning to tall detention in my community. Success Criteria: I can state my group in Newark and use evidence to support presentation.	ke a position on immigrant 's position on immigrant detention	Newark's experience of this past summer, after organizations like NJ a legislation banning the state, unexpired contra- house immigrant detail	TENT KNOWLEDGE (necessary prior knowledge) with immigrant detention is one that ended very recently—only reprotests and organized action by immigrant advocacy Alliance for Immigrant Justice. While New Jersey has passed recreation of new contracts between ICE and facilities with the rects can continue. As a result, a facility in Elizabeth continues to nees. History, however, shows that community action can be a this issue, with Fort Sill and Newark as examples.

3. ASSESSMENT

Formative: Day 2 Advanced Schema; Do Now & discussion (questions below); Questioning during project drafting (questions below)

Summative: Draft Presentation

4. INDIVIDUALIZED STUDENT NEEDS

• CI: Written/selected-response assessment (i.e., homework, draft presentation)

- SLD/OHI: Delegation of duties in groups, frequent check-ins during group work, posting of all lesson materials in Google Classroom for review/reference, extended time to complete assignments
- ELL: Translated source materials and presentation handout (all hardcopy because students have not yet been assigned Chromebooks)
- Technological access cannot be assumed, as some students do not have district-issued devices at this time (encourage groups for device-sharing and make materials accessible via cell phones)

PROCEDURE AND PRACTICE

TEACHER'S ROLE Questions to Ask	WHAT ARE STUDENTS DOING?	MATERIALS
1. LAUNCH/STARTER/ANTICIPATORY SET (3 min. review; 3 min. whole-class) Display & introduce Do Now: Do you think Essex County was right or wrong to stop using the county jail for immigrant detention? Lead discussion: Elicit whole-class responses from several students. Why do you think it was right/wrong? What role did activists play in the decision? Explain that while Essex County no longer has immigrant detention, Union County (Elizabeth) still does. Do you think that they should follow Newark's example?	Make notes of thoughts on the question, or rewatch the video if in need of a refresher. Share out notes, respond, and make connections to classmates' responses.	Google Slides: <u>Do</u> <u>Now</u>
2. LEARNING ACTIVITIES (25 min.) Introduce group project as an extension of the conversation about immigrant detention in Newark and the role of activism in creating reform. Explain how to access sources, choice board options, and exemplar work.	Ask clarifying questions and restate directions in their own words.	Google Slides: "Immigrant Detention Group Project"
Lead guided practice by filling in draft chart column with information from mural. List expectations for today's class: choose a format and complete the draft.	Volunteer responses during guided practice, ask clarifying questions, and restate directions in their own words.	
Support student self-sorting and relocation.	Create groups of 3-4 students.	

Circulate between groups to check for understanding: How does your group plan to present this? What position are you taking? What sources have you selected? How do they prove your position?	Work in their groups to choose a presentation format, create a draft, and (if time permits) begin to create their presentation.	
3. CLOSURE (4 min.) Reiterate expectations for project, and show rubric as a means of self-assessment. Remind students of Monday due date.	Ask clarifying questions and restate directions in their own words.	Google Slides: "Immigrant Detention Group Project"
HOMEWORK/FOLLOW UP ACTIVITY Direct students to assignment posted in Google Classroom, and explain that only one member of the group needs to submit the presentation.	Create (or finish creating) final version of presentation based on draft, with one member of group submitting in Google Classroom.	